

## Northwest History Consortium

### This Little Piggy Should've Stayed Home

**Susan Azevedo**

**7<sup>th</sup> Grade**

**National Standard**

**Era 4: Expansion and Reform (1801-1861) / Standard 2**

*Standard 2: How the industrial revolution, increasing immigration, the rapid expansion of slavery, and the westward movement changed the lives of Americans and led toward regional tensions.*

**Washington State EALRs (Grade 7)**

*EALR (History) 4.1.2: Understands how the following themes and developments help to define eras in Washington State history from time 1854 to present:*

- *Territory and treaty making (1854 - 1889).*

*EALR (History) 4.2.1: Understands and analyzes how individuals caused change in U.S. history*

**Enduring Understandings:**

- **Governmental decisions impact our daily lives.**
- **Balancing individual rights with the common good is an ongoing challenge.**

#### **BACKGROUND**

A land dispute occurred between The United States and Great Britain when the Oregon Treaty of 1846 was established in London setting the boundary on the 49<sup>th</sup> parallel. Some confusion arose over the language used in the treaty when describing the “channel” in the island areas located off the coast of Vancouver Island to the Strait of Juan de Fuca. The problem was that there were actually two channels: the Haro Strait near Vancouver Island and the Rosario Strait near the mainland. The San Juan Islands lay between them, and both countries claimed the entire island group.

As early as 1845 the Hudson’s Bay Company <HBC>, based at Fort Victoria, claimed San Juan Island, only seven miles across from the Haro Strait. American settlers established homes and farms on the Island, and the Washington territorial legislature made a formal claim to the area in 1853. Tension was created by the land dispute, and the situation became a crisis on June 15, 1859, when Lyman Cutlar, an American, defended his property by shooting and killing a company pig rooting in his garden.

"HBC officials were outraged and sought the farmer’s arrest." When British authorities threatened to arrest Cutlar and evict all his countrymen from the island as trespassers, American citizens on the island sent a plea to the mainland for military assistance and protection. "In July, George E. Pickett (later of Pickett’s Charge fame) was dispatched to San Juan with a small contingent of soldiers. The British reacted by sending three warships into the harbor to encourage Pickett to withdraw. The American force remained in place and on two occasions was supplemented with additional soldiers. The British countered by sending two more warships, [bringing the total to five]."

When President Buchanan learned of these developments, he was not a happy camper and sent General Winfield Scott to salvage the situation. Scott quickly ". . . managed to arrange a mutual

## Northwest History Consortium

### This Little Piggy Should've Stayed Home

reduction in military presence. Later, an agreement for the island's joint military occupation was reached. The United States soon became involved in its civil war and neglected for a number of years to push for the dispute's permanent solution."

"In 1871, the matter was referred to an arbitration panel under the auspices [support] of Kaiser Wilhelm I. A ruling was handed down the following year, which established the boundary through Haro Strait and made San Juan Island a possession of the United States." There were no reparations paid for the pig.

"The Pig War." Online Highways. 2010. Florence, OR. 5 November 2010 <[http://www.u-shistory.com/pages/h\\_1030.html](http://www.u-shistory.com/pages/h_1030.html)>.

#### PROBLEM

Should reparations (compensation) for the pig have been paid?

#### SCENARIO

The San Juan Porcine Society, with historical connections to workers from the Hudson's Bay Company, have petitioned the only known descendants of Lyman Cutlar to pay restitution with interest for the pig that their relative killed on June 15<sup>th</sup> 1859. Since the cost of the pig was never paid for when the final boundary limits were determined, the descendants of Lyman Cutlar feel that the arbitration decision made in the 1800s is final and binding, and they owe nothing.

Your group is working as law interns. Your justice has asked that you conduct background research on this case in order to offer recommendations for the outcome. Ultimately, should the descendants of the Cutlar family pay restitution to the workers of the Hudson's Bay Company or not?

#### TASK

Prepare an informational brief for your justice that outlines your findings. Give a recommendation as to whether restitutions should be awarded to the workers of the Hudson's Bay Company that would be paid for by the descendants of Lyman Cutlar.

## Northwest History Consortium

### This Little Piggy Should've Stayed Home

#### RESOURCES

##### Book

Green, Michael K., and Carlson, Laurie Winn. Washington in The Pacific Northwest, Salt Lake City, UT: Gibbs Smith, 2002.

##### Internet

"Canada's Merchants since 1670." 2010. Hudson's Bay Company (HBC). ©2010 HBC. Scarborough, Ontario, Canada.. 5 November 2010 <<http://www.hbc.com/hbcheritage/>>.

"The Pig War." Online Highways. 2010. Florence, OR. 5 November 2010 <[http://www.u-shistory.com/pages/h\\_1030.html](http://www.u-shistory.com/pages/h_1030.html)>.

"The Pig War." National Park Service (US Department of the Interior). 2010. Washington, DC. 5 November 2010 <<http://www.nps.gov/sajh/historyculture/the-pig-war.htm>>.

#### ASSESSMENT

This will be a practice PBL to introduce the PBL method to students so that the lesson will be graded on completion of the task—presenting their findings either in written form or PowerPoint (or other student-created presentation). The teacher will use a PBL rubric to grade future scenarios. For this practice PBL, the teacher will walk the students through the rubric and discuss their expectations for meeting the standards listed in each category.

## Northwest History Consortium

### This Little Piggy Should've Stayed Home

#### PBL Group Process Rubric

CATEGORY	4	3	2	1
<b>On Task</b>	The group is working on the assignment and uses their time efficiently.	The group was on task the majority of the time. They only needed 1 reminder..	The group needed a 2-4 reminders to get back on task.	The group needed constant reminders to be on task.
<b>Problem-Solving</b>	Each member contributes to solving the issues and problems that arise in the group.	Most of the time the group was able to solve their own problems. Needed guidance only once.	The group needed guidance to solve problems 2-3 times.	The group was not able to solve problems that arose.
<b>Working with Others</b>	Members of the group listen to, share and support each other.	Group members most often listened to and supported each other. Problems only arose once.	Group members frequently (2-3 times) had difficulty listening and sharing ideas.	Group members did not work cooperatively and were not listening to each other.
<b>Prepared for Class</b>	Each member came to class prepared to work on the assignment each and everyday.	Group was most often prepared for class. Had to retrieve supplies 1-2 times.	Group was more unprepared than not, and had to get supplies 3-4 times.	Group members were continually unprepared for class work and had to get supplies on a regular basis.

Azevedo, Susan. "PBL Group Process Rubric" adapted from Rachel Edwards' lesson on Taylor, Kaycee. *Indian Policy in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century*. [NWESD Organization](http://www.nwesi.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/6.4_IndianPolicy.Taylor.11.pdf). 2008. Anacortes, WA. 5 July 2009 <[http://www.nwesi.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/6.4\\_IndianPolicy.Taylor.11. pdf](http://www.nwesi.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/6.4_IndianPolicy.Taylor.11.pdf)>.

## Northwest History Consortium

# This Little Piggy Should've Stayed Home

## PBL Self-Evaluation Rubric

CATEGORY	4	3	2	1
<b>Quality of Research</b>	Research questions and notes taken were in-depth and appropriate.	Research questions and notes were appropriate, but they were not as in-depth as they should be.	Research is incomplete and notes are not as in-depth as they should be.	Research notes are not appropriate for the topic, and there is no clear focus.
<b>Sources and annotations</b>	All sources were cited and you explained why your sources are credible-minimum 3 primary sources.	Comment, but 1-2 sources are not cited and/or annotated.	3-4 sources are not cited and/or annotated.	No sources are cited and/or annotated.
<b>Requirements</b>	All steps of process are completed, and guided worksheet is turned in. Your personal responsibility was completed.	1-2 steps of the process are not completed or documented	3-4 steps of the process are not completed or documented.	Worksheet requirements were not completed, and personal responsibility was not completed.
<b>Presentation</b>	Presentation was loud, clear, neat and organized.	Presentation was almost loud or clear enough for the audience to hear easily, and it was organized.	Presentation was way too soft, and it was not very neat or organized.	Presentation was very hard to hear and not organized.

## Northwest History Consortium

### This Little Piggy Should've Stayed Home

#### REFERENCES/CITATIONS

Azevedo, Susan. "This Little Piggy Should've Stayed Home." NWESD Organization. 2010. Anacortes, WA. 5 November 2010 <[http://www.nwesd.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/4.2\\_PigWar.Azevedo.7.pdf](http://www.nwesd.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/4.2_PigWar.Azevedo.7.pdf)>.

Azevedo, Susan. "PBL Group Process Rubric" adapted from Rachel Edwards' lesson on Taylor, Kaycee. *Indian Policy in the 19<sup>th</sup> Century*. NWESD Organization. 2008. Anacortes, WA. 5 July 2009 <[http://www.nwesd.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/6.4\\_IndianPolicy.Taylor.11.pdf](http://www.nwesd.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/6.4_IndianPolicy.Taylor.11.pdf)>.

Azevedo, Susan. "PBL Self-Evaluation Rubric." NWESD Organization. 2010. Anacortes, WA. 5 Nov. 2010 <[http://www.nwesd.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/4.2\\_PigWar.Azevedo.7.pdf](http://www.nwesd.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/4.2_PigWar.Azevedo.7.pdf)>.

"History Standards for Grades 5-12 United States." UCLA National Center for History in The Schools. 2009. University of California, Los Angeles, CA: 31 May 2009 <<http://nchs.ucla.edu/standards/era1-5-12.html>>.

OSPI. "Washington State Social Studies EALRs, Grade 7." OSPI (Office of Superintendent of Instruction). 2010. Olympia, WA. 5 November 2010 <<http://standards.ospi.k12.wa.us/ResourcesOfGLE.aspx?subject=6,GLE&gl=8&ea=36&co=105&gle=3451>>.

"The Pig War." Online Highways. 2010. Florence, OR. 5 November 2010 <<http://www.u-s-history.com/pages/h1030.html>>.