

Northwest History Consortium

Arizona Immigration

Nate Cogdill
8th Grade

National Standard

Era 6: The Development of the Industrial United States (1870-1900) / Standard 2

Standard 2: Massive immigration after 1870 and how new social patterns, conflicts, and ideas of national unity developed amid growing cultural diversity.

Washington State Standards (EALRs)

***EALR 4: History** - The student understands and applies knowledge of historical thinking, chronology, eras, turning points, major ideas, individuals, and themes of local, Washington State, tribal, United States, and world history in order to evaluate how history shapes the present and future.*

***Component 4.2:** The student understands and analyzes the causal factors that have shaped major events in history.*

***GLE 4.2.1:** The student understands and analyzes how individuals and movements impact U.S. History (1776-1900).*

***GLE 4.2.2:** The student understands and analyzes how cultures and cultural groups contributed to U.S. History (1776-1900).*

***Component 4.3:** The student understands that there are multiple perspectives and interpretations of historical events.*

***GLE 4.3.1:** The student understands and analyzes historical materials from a variety of perspectives in U.S. History (1776-1900).*

***GLE 4.3.2:** The student analyzes multiple causal factors to create positions on major events in U.S. History (1776-1900).*

***Component 4.4:** The student uses history to understand the present and plan for the future.*

***GLE 4.4.1:** The student analyzes how a historical event in United States history helps us to understand a current issue.*

***EALR 5: Social Studies** - The student understands and applies reasoning skills to conduct research, deliberate, form and evaluate positions through the processes of reading, writing, and communicating.*

***Component 5.1:** The student uses critical reasoning skills to analyze and evaluate positions.*

***GLE 5.1.1:** The student understands reasons based on evidence for a position about events in United States History.*

***GLE 5.1.2:** The student evaluates the logic of reasons for a position about events in United States History.*

***Component 5.2:** The student uses inquiry-based research.*

***GLE 5.2.1:** The student creates and uses research questions that are tied to an essential question to focus inquiry on social studies and historical events.*

***GLE 5.2.2:** The student evaluates the logic of positions in primary and secondary sources to interpret an issue or historical event.*

***Component 5.3:** The student deliberates public issues.*

***GLE 5.3.1:** The student applies democratic ideals outline in fundamental documents to clarify and address public issues in the context of a discussion.*

***Component 5.4:** The student creates a product that uses social studies content to support a thesis and presents the product in an appropriate manner to a meaningful audience.*

***GLE 5.4.1:** The student uses sources within the body of the work to support position in a paper or presentation.*

***GLE 5.4.2:** The student uses appropriate format to cite sources within an essay.*

Northwest History Consortium

Arizona Immigration

PROBLEM (FOR TEACHEERS' EYES ONLY)

Possibilities:

1. Is the Arizona Immigration Law SB1070 constitutional?
2. Is this an appropriate use of the US Supreme Court? Checks and balances?
3. Federalism / States' Rights?
4. Were anti-Chinese immigration laws constitutional? If so, is that acceptable in our society? Sociologically? Morally? Ethically? Politically? Economically?
5. Should Chinese immigration law be followed as a model for present-day immigration policy, such as the Arizona Immigration Law SB1070?
6. Etc.

SCENARIO

In 2010, the Arizona Immigration Law SB 1070 sparked emotional responses from both supporters and opposition which has manifested into varied multimedia coverage, and it has led to emotional debates and protests from the streets of White Center in South Seattle, to the board rooms of Tacoma, to the US President's office in the White House.

The Arizona Senate passed the Immigration Law in April. "It requires police officers, 'when practicable,' to detain people they reasonably suspect are in the country without authorization and to verify their status with federal officials, unless doing so would hinder an investigation or emergency medical treatment. It also makes it a state crime — a misdemeanor — to not carry immigration papers. In addition, it allows people to sue local government or agencies if they believe that federal or state immigration law is not being enforced. States across the country have proposed or enacted hundreds of bills addressing immigration since 2007, the last time a federal effort to reform immigration law collapsed. Last year, there were a record number of laws enacted (222) and resolutions (131) in 48 states, according to the National Conference of State Legislatures. While police demands of documents are common on subways, highways, and in public places in some countries, including France, Arizona is the first state to demand that immigrants meet federal requirements to carry identity documents legitimizing their presence on American soil."

Archibold, Randal C. "Arizona Enacts Stringent Law on Immigration." 23 April 2010. The New York Times. ©2010 The New York Times. New York, NY. 22 Dec. 2010 <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/24/us/politics/24immig.html?_r=3>.

Many opponents have claimed that the Arizona Immigration Law is just like the Geary Act of 1892 which required all Chinese residents of the United States to carry a resident permit, a sort of internal passport. Failure to carry the permit at all times was punishable by deportation or a year at hard labor. The Geary Act ultimately failed due to a lack of financial resources being directed towards its enforcement, but supporters of the Arizona law argue that the law is Constitutional and should be supported.

Northwest History Consortium

Arizona Immigration

TASKS

Washington State has been attempting to create a fair and balanced immigration policy for over a century. With the recent passing of the Arizona Immigration Law SB 1070 and the backlash against Arizona's government that has followed, Washington State government officials want to be very careful with their policy design. Advisors to Governor Gregoire have pointed out that US immigration law and Washington State immigration policies have had their problems in the past, especially against groups who affected labor or other perceived threats. Political scientists have cited their concerns that future immigration policy in Washington could have negative political, sociological, economic, cultural, and geographic consequences similar to immigration law directed towards the Chinese and other Asian groups in the late 1800s. Laws such as the Geary Act and the Chinese Exclusion Act were among several of these policies.

Governor Gregoire's advisors have created a non-discriminatory research panel that includes people of different race, ethnicity, sex, gender, religion, disability, and age. The purpose of this panel is to give a representative voice to all corners of our community in order to utilize multiple perspectives, while ultimately creating a fair and practical immigration policy for our state. Members of the panel are expected to consider the political scientists' concerns of past immigration mistakes and to use those lessons learned to create ideas for a plan to help Governor Gregoire and the State of Washington avoid those same mistakes in the future.

One slot of the panel is reserved for 13- to 14-year-olds, and you have been selected to represent your unique perspective and to present to the Immigration Research Panel, including Governor Gregoire, in two weeks.

Research the history of American Chinese immigration policy and use lessons learned to create an Immigration Plan Proposal for Governor Gregoire and the Immigration Research Panel. This is the chance of a lifetime to consider past public policy and to provide your input to create future policy. Make sure that you utilize your opportunity.

Alternate Tasks:

- a) **Constitutional Issue:** The Arizona Immigration Law SB1070 has been appealed to the US Supreme Court, and the justices are debating whether to support and confirm the law or to rescind the law. You are a research assistant to the librarian of the US Supreme Court. The librarian has tasked you with researching for the justices and making your recommendation to the US Supreme Court regarding whether to support or to rescind the law in Arizona.
- b) **Economics/Business/Legal Issue:** You work in public relations for Darden Restaurants (Olive Garden and Red Lobster) who operate in 25 states and who were preparing to open a restaurant in Phoenix, Arizona. Following the passing of the Arizona Immigration Law SB1070, Darden administration has received requests from employees to discontinue with their plan to open a restaurant in Phoenix in protest of the law because Darden Restaurants employ thousands of Mexican, Latino, and Hispanic workers. The CEO of Darden

Northwest History Consortium

Arizona Immigration

Restaurants has asked that you research the implications of this decision, and he/she wants you to draft a statement to deliver to shareholders of the corporation and to the people of the United States.

- c) **Political Issue:** You have acquired a job working for the Washington State Governor's Office as a Public Relations Assistant. Many Washington State Representatives have reported to the Governor's Office that their constituents would favor an immigration law similar to the Arizona Immigration Law SB1070. The Washington State Apple Commission, the Washington Association of Grape Growers, and the Hop Growers of America have also contacted Governor Gregoire to say that they are concerned that any attempt to create legislation similar to Arizona's could be catastrophic for Washington State. As associations that rely on migrant workers they stand to be strongly affected by any anti-immigration policy. The Washington State Secretary of State has pressured Governor Gregoire for a statement about her plans to lead future policy in our state. Governor Gregoire's Office has contacted you and has requested a public relations' statement to deliver to the media about Washington State's future immigration plan.

RESOURCES

Internet

Almeida, Monica. "Protest Erupts Over Immigration in Arizona." The New York Times. ©2010 The New York Times. New York, NY. 22 Dec. 2010 <http://www.nytimes.com/slideshow/2010/04/24/us/20100424_IMMIGRATION.html?scp=1&sq=Protest%20erups%20over%20immigration%20in%20arizona&st=cse>.

Archibold, Randal C. "Arizona Enacts Stringent Law on Immigration." 23 April 2010. The New York Times. ©2010 The New York Times. New York, NY. 22 Dec. 2010 <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/24/us/politics/24immig.html?_r=3>.

Bolduan, Kate. "Students Lobby to Become Citizens." 19 July 2010. CNN (Turner Broadcasting, Inc.). ©2010 CNN. Atlanta, GA. 22 Dec. 2010 <<http://www.cnn.com/video/#/video/politics/2010/07/19/bolduan.dream.act.cnn?iref=allsearch>>.

"Chinese." HistoryLink.Org (The Free Online Encyclopedia of Washington State History). 2010. Seattle, WA. 22 Dec. 2010 <<http://www.historylink.org/index.cfm?keyword=Chinese&DisplayPage=results.cfm>>.

Eskenazi, Stuart. "Familiar Landscape Lured Scandinavians." 4 Nov. 2001. The Seattle Times. © The Seattle Times. 22 Dec. 2010 <http://seattletimes.nwsourc.com/news/local/seattle_history/articles/scandinavians.html>.

Northwest History Consortium

Arizona Immigration

"The Geary Act of 1892." 5 May 1892. University of California (Hastings College of Law). ©2009 - 2010. San Francisco, CA. 22 Dec. 2010 <<http://www.uchastings.edu/racism-race/gearyact.html>>.

Johnson, Kevin R. "The History of Racial Exclusion in the US Immigration Laws" from *Indiana Law Journal*, v. 73, Fall 1998: 1111-1159, 1112-1148. 10 March 2010. University of Dayton. ©2001 - 2010. Dayton, OH. 22 Dec. 2010 <<http://academic.udayton.edu/race/02rights/immigr09.htm>>.

Johnson, Kevin R. "Race, the Immigration Laws, and Domestic Race Relations: A 'Magic Mirror' into the Heart of Darkness." 1998. Indiana University (Maurer School of Law). ©2010. Bloomington, IN. 22 Dec. 2010 <http://www.law.indiana.edu/ilj/volumes/v73/no4/02.html#N_1_>.

Lopez-Mills, Dario. "Will Arizona's Immigration Law Survive?" 26 April 2010. The New York Times. ©2010 The New York Times. New York, NY. 22 Dec. 2010 <<http://roomfordebate.blogs.nytimes.com/2010/04/26/will-arizonas-immigration-law-survive/?ref=politics>>.

Pearce, Russell, Senator. "Senate Bill 1070." 23 April 2010. Arizona State Legislature. ©2007 - 2010. Phoenix, AZ. 22 Dec. 2010 <<http://www.azleg.gov/alispdfs/council/SB1070-HB2162.PDF>>.

Vellos, Diana. "A History of Immigration Law Regarding People of Color" from *Immigrant Latina Domestic Workers and Sexual Harassment*, *American University Journal of Gender and the Law*, v. 407, Spring, 1997, 414 - 418. 10 March 2010. University of Dayton. ©2001 - 2010. Dayton, OH. 22 Dec. 2010 <<http://academic.udayton.edu/race/02rights/immigr01.htm>>.

Miscellaneous

Legislation and Supreme Court Precedent

including Arizona Senate Bill 1070 and immigration laws

Print and Online Newspaper Articles

including *The New York Times* and *The Seattle Times*

News Websites, Blogs, Pictorials, Videos, etc.

including CNN and The New York Times

Scholarly Articles from Universities and Databases

including history of Immigration Law Reviews from the University of Dayton Law School and Indiana Law School

Arizona Immigration

Encyclopedias

Print Sources

from your school library

Museum Collections

including historical articles, photos, and artifacts from Museums, such as MOHAI, accessed from HistoryLink.org and possibly on a field trip! May also consider the Wing Luke Museum.

Northwest History Consortium

Arizona Immigration

ASSESSMENT (YOUR PBL WILL BE ASSESSED BASED ON THE FOLLOWING RUBRIC:)

| | ←-----PASSING | NOT PASSING -----→ | | |
|--|--|---|--|---|
| GLE (EALR) | 4 - Excellent | 3 – Proficient | 2 - Partial | 1 - Minimal |
| <p>4.3.1. Analyzes differing interpretations of events in U.S. history</p> <p>EALR 4.3. Understands that there are multiple perspectives and interpretations of historical events.</p> | <p>A</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> States a position on the question States why studying this historical question helps us to understand current issues and events. | <p>States a position on a historical question that outlines a reason(s) in support of the position.</p> | <p>States a position on a historical question that is unclear or vague.</p> | <p>Describes events or presents ideas about how people lived during a time period.</p> |
| | <p>5.2.1. Evaluates and revises research questions to refine inquiry on an issue or event.</p> <p>5.2.2. Evaluates the validity, reliability, and credibility of sources when researching an issue or event.</p> <p>EALR 5.2. Uses inquiry-based research.</p> | <p>B</p> <p>Provides background on the historical question from three or more of the following social science perspectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> geographic cultural political economic sociological psychological | <p>Provides background on the historical question from two of the following social science perspectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> geographic cultural political economic sociological psychological. | <p>Provides background on the historical question from one of the following social science perspectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> geographic cultural political economic sociological psychological |
| <p>5.4.1. Evaluates and interprets other points of view on an issue within a paper or presentation.</p> | <p>C1</p> <p>Provides three reasons that, taken together, logically lead to the position. In addition, provides at least one counter-reason to the position.</p> | <p>Provides three reasons that, taken together, <u>logically lead to the position.</u></p> | <p>Provides two logical reasons for the position</p> | <p>Provides one reason that is relevant to the position</p> |
| <p>5.4.2. Evaluates the validity, reliability, and credibility of sources when researching an issue or event.</p> <p>(EALR 5.2. Uses inquiry-based research.)</p> <p>5.4.2. Creates strategies to avoid plagiarism and respects intellectual property when developing a paper or presentation.</p> | <p>C2</p> <p>The evidence for the position includes: An evaluation of how well four or more different sources support the reasons for the position including primary sources AND published interpretations.</p> | <p>The evidence for the position includes: An evaluation of how well three different sources support the reasons for the position including primary sources AND published interpretations.</p> | <p>The evidence for the position includes: An evaluation of how well two different sources support the reasons for the position including primary sources OR published interpretations.</p> | <p>The evidence for the position includes: An evaluation of how well one source supports the reasons for the position including a primary source OR a published interpretation.</p> |
| <p>5.2.2. Evaluates the validity, reliability, and credibility of sources when researching an issue or event.</p> <p>(EALR 5.2. Uses inquiry-based research.)</p> <p>5.4.2. Creates strategies to avoid plagiarism and respects intellectual property when developing a paper or presentation.</p> | <p>D</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Makes explicit references within the paper or presentation to four or more <u>credible</u> sources that provide relevant information. <p>(Credible means really well known, such as the Constitution, or enough information given so you can find the quote or idea referred to)</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Makes explicit references within the paper or presentation to three <u>credible</u> sources that provide relevant information. | <p>Makes explicit references within the paper or presentation to two sources that provide relevant information.</p> | <p>Makes explicit references within the paper or presentation to one source that provides relevant information.</p> |

- Your recommendation will be evaluated based on the above rubric.
- You must also include a Works Cited page in MLA format and use proper MLA citations in your essay, PowerPoint, Photo Story, or other format of presentation.

Northwest History Consortium

Arizona Immigration

REFERENCES/CITATIONS

- Archibold, Randal C. "Arizona Enacts Stringent Law on Immigration." 23 April 2010. The New York Times. ©2010 The New York Times. New York, NY. 22 Dec. 2010 <http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/24/us/politics/24immig.html?_r=3>.
- Cogdill, Nate. "Arizona Immigration." NWESD Organization. 2008. Anacortes, WA. 22 Dec. 2010 <http://www.nwesd.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/6.2__Immigration.Policies.Cogdill.8.pdf>.
- "History Standards for Grades 5-12 United States." UCLA National Center for History in the Schools. 2005. Los Angeles, CA. 21 May 2009 <<http://nchs.ucla.edu/standards/us-standards5>>.
- OSPI. "Social Studies Essential Learning Requirements: Recommended Grade-by-Grade Sequence for Grade Level Expectations – K-12." Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction. 2009. Olympia, WA. 22 Dec. 2010 <http://standards.ospi.k12.wa.us/EalrsPubDocs/GradeSpecificDocument/Social%20Studies/GLEs-Social_Studies-Grade11.doc>.