

Northwest History Consortium

Mediating Between Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism

Revised Version of “Presidential Recommendation: Imperialism, Assistance, or Inaction” by
Susan Black

Susan Black
10th – 12th Grade

National Standard

Era 7: The Emergence of Modern America (1890-1930) / Standard 2

Standard 2: The changing role of the United States in world affairs through World War I

Washington State EALRs

Civics- 3: The student understands the purposes and organization of international relationships and how the United States foreign policy is made.

Civics-3.2.3B: Evaluate foreign policy decisions and how they affect nations

History-1: The student examines and understands major ideas, eras, themes, developments, turning points, chronology, and cause-effect relationships in United States, world, and Washington State history.

History-1.2.3: Identify and analyze major concepts, people, and events in 20th century U.S. History including: Emergence of America as a world power (1890-1918)

Inquiry and Information Skills

Inquiry and Information Skills-1.1: Understand and use inquiry and Information skills required by citizens in a democratic society

Inquiry and Information Skills-1.1.A: Define central question

Writing-3.1

Math-2.2: 1.1B

1.1.3A: Formulate a thesis statement in the social studies that examines why as well as hows

Inquiry and Information Skills-1.1F: Apply information

Writing- 2.2, 2.3, 2.4, 3.5

Communication-2.1, 2.5

Math-4.3

1.1.3F: Create a product that uses social studies content to support a thesis and present product in appropriate manner to a meaningful audience

Inquiry and Information Skills-2.1: Understand and apply critical thinking and problem solving skills to make informed and reasoned decisions

Inquiry and Information Skills-2.1.3A: Voice original ideas; demonstrate content knowledge; persuade audience; listen critically and build upon the ideas of others; ask clarifying questions and challenge statements of others; negotiate and compromise

Inquiry and Information Skills-2.1.3B: Participate in developing group process, persuade, compromise, debate, resolve conflicts, and negotiate differences

Inquiry and Information Skills-3.1: Understand and apply critical thinking and problem solving skills to make informed and reasoned decisions

Inquiry and Information Skills-3.1.4A: Identify central issue; formulate appropriate questions; identify multiple perspectives; compare and contrast; validate data using multiple sources; determine relevant information; paraphrase problem

BACKGROUND

“After fighting the Spanish-American War the US and Spain met to sign the Treaty of Paris, in which the US was given Puerto Rico, Guam, and the Philippines for a set price. The Philippines were purchased from Spain for a mere \$20 million dollars. Mark Twain called this payment an ‘entrance fee into society—the Society of Sceptered Thieves.’ At the time of the Treaty of Paris the US already controlled the city of Manila, but had not ventured into other parts of the

Northwest History Consortium

Mediating Between Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism

Revised Version of “Presidential Recommendation: Imperialism, Assistance, or Inaction” by Susan Black

Philippine Islands. After signing the treaty, President McKinley ordered the War Department to bring all of the islands under military control because the people of the Philippines were too ‘uncivilized’ to govern themselves. This shocked the Filipinos, because they had expected the U.S. to help them in their struggle for independence. Not only did the US not help the Philippines in their struggle for freedom, they refused to grant them freedom. . . .”

“American Imperialism of the Philippines: ‘A Gift from the Gods.’” Arkansas School for Mathematics, Sciences, and the Arts. 2010. Hot Springs, AR. 6 August 2010 <<http://asms.k12.ar.us/classes/humanities/worldstud/97-98/imper/Philippines/USA.HTM>>.

PROBLEM

The US is moving away from the policy of isolationism which had been employed throughout the 19th century, much to the dismay of those who subscribed the President Monroe’s doctrine of 1823. "In the wars of the European powers in matters relating to themselves we have never taken part, nor does it comport with our policy, so to do."

Monroe, President James. “Monroe Doctrine – A Speech by James Monroe.” 2 December 1823. Famous Quotes. 2010. United Kingdom. 6 August 2010 <http://www.famousquotes.me.uk/speeches/James_Monroe/index.htm>.

SCENARIO

Some of the most influential men in and around Washington, DC have vastly different opinions on what is best for the US at the conclusion of the Spanish-American War—should we engage in territorial expansion or return to being isolationists? The reasons behind these attitudes are complex—religion, economics, and concern over the competency of the Filipino people to govern themselves after Spanish rule. Each group, the imperialists and the anti-imperialists, are adamant that their proposed course of action is the only reasonable way to proceed.

The White Man's Burden

by Rudyard Kipling

Take up the White Man's burden--
Send forth the best ye breed--
Go bind your sons to exile
To serve your captives' need;
To wait in heavy harness,
On fluttered folk and wild--
Your new-caught, sullen peoples,
Half-devil and half-child.

Northwest History Consortium

Mediating Between Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism

Revised Version of "Presidential Recommendation: Imperialism, Assistance, or Inaction" by
Susan Black

Take up the White Man's burden--
In patience to abide,
To veil the threat of terror
And check the show of pride;
By open speech and simple,
An hundred times made plain
To seek another's profit,
And work another's gain.

Take up the White Man's burden--
The savage wars of peace--
Fill full the mouth of Famine
And bid the sickness cease;
And when your goal is nearest
The end for others sought,
Watch sloth and heathen Folly
Bring all your hopes to nought.

Take up the White Man's burden--
No tawdry rule of kings,
But toil of serf and sweeper--
The tale of common things.
The ports ye shall not enter,
The roads ye shall not tread,
Go mark them with your living,
And mark them with your dead.

Take up the White Man's burden--
And reap his old reward:
The blame of those ye better,
The hate of those ye guard--
The cry of hosts ye humour
(Ah, slowly!) toward the light:--
"Why brought he us from bondage,
Our loved Egyptian night?"

Take up the White Man's burden--
Ye dare not stoop to less--
Nor call too loud on Freedom
To cloke your weariness;
By all ye cry or whisper,
By all ye leave or do,
The silent, sullen peoples
Shall weigh your gods and you.

Northwest History Consortium

Mediating Between Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism

Revised Version of “Presidential Recommendation: Imperialism, Assistance, or Inaction” by Susan Black

Take up the White Man's burden--
Have done with childish days--
The lightly proffered laurel,
The easy, ungrudged praise.
Comes now, to search your manhood
Through all the thankless years
Cold, edged with dear-bought wisdom,
The judgment of your peers!

“This famous poem, written by Britain's imperial poet, was a response to the American take over of the Philippines after the Spanish-American War.”

Kipling, Rudyard. “The White Man’s Burden.” 1899. The Internet Modern History Sourcebook (Fordham University). ©1997 – 2010 Paul Halsall. Bronx, NY. 6 August 2010 <<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/Kipling.html>>. Reprinted with permission.

“Mark Twain said, ‘I thought that it would be a great thing to give a whole lot of freedom to the Filipinos, but I guess now that it's better to let them give it to themselves’. (1) When America imperialized the Philippines, they were already fighting for their freedom from Spain. They thought that America would help them to gain their freedom, but instead America took it away from them, causing them to fight yet again to gain the freedom that they had long been without. This fight for freedom became the Philippine-American War.”

“American Imperialism of the Philippines: ‘A Gift from the Gods.’” Arkansas School for Mathematics, Sciences, and the Arts. 2010. Hot Springs, AR. 6 August 2010 <<http://asms.k12.ar.us/classes/humanities/worldstud/97-98/imper/Philippines/USA.HTM>>.

Twain, Mark. Mark Twain’s Weapons of Satire: Anti-Imperialist Writings on the Philippine-American War. Jim Zwick, editor. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1992.

The US Congress would prefer not to take responsibility for deciding this issue—in that if the US chooses to expand its influence, Congress would need to allocate money for this endeavor—and has commissioned a non-partisan committee to arbitrate the matter.

TASK

You and your group are part of a mediation committee tasked with coming up with a compromise between the politically influential imperialists and the anti-imperialists regarding the US’s motives toward the Philippines. Your committee is to submit the compromise to President McKinley for his evaluation. Despite his strong feelings toward expanding the US’s influence around the globe, Congress has tied his hands about any action that differs from your negotiated compromise, since Congress approves and allocates funds.

Northwest History Consortium

Mediating Between Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism

Revised Version of “Presidential Recommendation: Imperialism, Assistance, or Inaction” by Susan Black

Your report to President McKinley must include a thorough examination that addresses the complexities and ramifications of these negotiations and a comprehensive background on each side’s motivations.

RESOURCES

Books

Hakim, Joy. “The Spanish-American War.” A History of US: War, An Age of Extremes, 1890-1917. New York: Oxford University Press, 2005.

Schirmer, D. and Shalom, S.R., editors. The Philippines Reader [a reprint]. Boston, MA: South End Press, 1987.

Internet

Beveridge, Senator Alfred J. “In Support of an American Empire” from *The Congressional Record, 56th Congress, 1 session*. Mount Holyoke College. 2010. South Hadley, MA. 22 July 2010 <<http://www.mtholyoke.edu/acad/intrel/ajb72.htm>>.

Beveridge, Senator Alfred (R-Indiana). “From a Speech in Congress on January 9, 1900” from *The Congressional Record, 56th Congress, 1st session*. History Matters (George Mason University). 2010. Fairfax, VA. 22 July 2010 <<http://historymatters.gmu.edu/blackboard/beveridge.html>>.

Bryan, William Jennings. “The Paralyzing Influence of Imperialism” from the Official Proceedings of the Democratic National Convention. July 1900. Mount Holyoke College. 2010. South Hadley, MA. 22 July 2010 <<http://www.mtholyoke.edu/acad/intrel/bryan.htm>>.

Bryan, William Jennings. “Speeches of William Jennings Bryan.” 11 Oct. 2005. Michigan State Libraries (Vincent Voice Library). 2010. East Lansing, MI. 9 August 2010 <<http://vvl.lib.msu.edu/showfindingaid.cfm?findaidid=BryanWJ>>.

Carnegie, Andrew. “Distant Possessions: The Parting of Ways (excerpts)” from *The Gospel of Wealth*, edited by Jim Zwick. ©1995 – 2010 by Jim Zwick. All Rights Reserved. Vancouver Island University. 2010. Nanaimo, BC, Canada. 22 July 2010 <<http://web.viu.ca/davies/H324War/Carnegie.Distant.1898.htm>>.

Northwest History Consortium

Mediating Between Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism

Revised Version of “Presidential Recommendation: Imperialism, Assistance, or Inaction” by
Susan Black

Halsall, Paul. “Modern History Sourcebook: American Anti-Imperialist League, 1899” from the *Internet Modern History Sourcebook*. ©1997 Paul Halsall. Modern History Sourcebook (Fordham University). 1997 – 2010. Bronx, NY. 22 July 2010 <<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/1899antiimp.html>>.

Halsall, Paul. “Modern History Sourcebook: Albert Beveridge: The March of the Flag, 16 September 1898” from the *Internet Modern History Sourcebook*. ©1997 Paul Halsall. Modern History Sourcebook (Fordham University). 1997 – 2010. Bronx, NY. 22 July 2010 <<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/1898beveridge.html>>.

Hoar, George. “The Lust for Empire” from *The Congressional Record*, 55th Congress, 3rd session. Mount Holyoke College. 2010. South Hadley, MA. 22 July 2010 <<http://www.mtholyoke.edu/acad/intrel/ghoar.htm>>.

McKinley, William. “War Message” from the U.S. Department of State, *Papers Relating to the Foreign Affairs (Washington)*. 1898. Mount Holyoke College. 2010. South Hadley, MA. 22 July 2010 <<http://www.mtholyoke.edu/acad/intrel/mkinly2.htm>>.

Rusling, General James. “Interview with President William McKinley” from *The Christian Advocate*, 22 January 1903. History Matters (George Mason University). 2010. Fairfax, VA. 9 August 2010 <<http://historymatters.gmu.edu/blackboard/mckinley.html>>.

“The Spanish-American War in Motion Pictures.” 19 Oct. 1998. The Library of Congress. 2010. Washington, DC. 9 August 2010 <<http://lcweb2.loc.gov/ammem/awhtml/sawhome.html>>.

“The U.S. Occupation: U.S. Senate Secret Debate Regarding Hawaii.” 31 May 1898. HawaiianKingdom.org. 2010. Honolulu, HI. 22 July 2010 <<http://www.hawaiiankingdom.org/us-senate-secret-debate-1898.shtml>>.

Wallace, Alfred Russel. “America, Cuba, and the Philippines (letter to the editor)” from the *Daily Chronicle* (London), 19 Jan. 1899. Western Kentucky University. 2010. Bowling Green, KY. 22 July 2010 <<http://people.wku.edu/charles.smith/wallace/S559.htm>>.

Woodford, Stewart L. “Note of United States to Spain, September 23, 1897” from the U.S. Department of State, *Papers Relating to the Foreign Relations of the United States*. 1901. Mount Holyoke College. 2010. South Hadley, MA. 22 July 2010 <<http://www.mtholyoke.edu/acad/intrel/woodford.htm>>.

Northwest History Consortium

Mediating Between Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism

Revised Version of “Presidential Recommendation: Imperialism, Assistance, or Inaction” by
Susan Black

ASSESSMENT

Written Recommendation to the President Rubric

CATEGORY	4	3	2	1
Information	All information presented in the recommendation was clear, accurate, and thorough.	Most information presented in the recommendation was clear, accurate, and thorough.	Most information presented in the recommendation was clear and accurate, but was not usually thorough.	Information had several inaccuracies OR was usually not clear.
Use of Facts/Statistics	Every major point was well supported with several relevant facts, statistics and/or examples.	Every major point was adequately supported with relevant facts, statistics and/or examples.	Every major point was supported with facts, statistics and/or examples, but the relevance of some was questionable.	Every point was not supported.
Understanding of Topic	The team clearly understood the topic in-depth and presented their information forcefully and convincingly.	The team clearly understood the topic in-depth and presented their information with ease.	The team seemed to understand the main points of the topic and presented those with ease.	The team did not show an adequate understanding of the topic.
Position Statement	The position statement provides a clear, strong statement of the author's position on the topic.	The position statement provides a clear statement of the author's position on the topic.	A position statement is present, but does not make the author's position clear.	There is no position statement.
Support for Position	Includes 3 or more pieces of evidence (facts, statistics, examples, real-life experiences) that support the position statement. The writer anticipates the reader's concerns, biases or arguments and has provided at least 1 counter-argument.	Includes 3 or more pieces of evidence (facts, statistics, examples, real-life experiences) that support the position statement.	Includes 2 pieces of evidence (facts, statistics, examples, real-life experiences) that support the position statement.	Includes 1 or fewer pieces of evidence (facts, statistics, examples, real-life experiences).

Northwest History Consortium

Mediating Between Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism

Revised Version of “Presidential Recommendation: Imperialism, Assistance, or Inaction” by
Susan Black

Evidence and Examples	All of the evidence and examples are specific, relevant and explanations are given that show how each piece of evidence supports the author's position.	Most of the evidence and examples are specific, relevant and explanations are given that show how each piece of evidence supports the author's position.	At least one of the pieces of evidence and examples is relevant and has an explanation that shows how that piece of evidence supports the author's position.	Evidence and examples are NOT relevant AND/OR are not explained.
Accuracy	All supportive facts and statistics are reported accurately.	Almost all supportive facts and statistics are reported accurately.	Most supportive facts and statistics are reported accurately.	Most supportive facts and statistics were inaccurately reported.
Sources	All sources used for quotes, statistics and facts are credible and cited correctly.	All sources used for quotes, statistics and facts are credible and most are cited correctly.	Most sources used for quotes, statistics and facts are credible and cited correctly.	Many sources are suspect (not credible) AND/OR are not cited correctly.

Northwest History Consortium

Mediating Between Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism

Revised Version of “Presidential Recommendation: Imperialism, Assistance, or Inaction” by
Susan Black

REFERENCES/CITATIONS

- ALTEC. “Rubistar: Written Recommendation to the President Rubric.” 4Teachers.org. 2009. Lawrence, KS. Advanced Learning Technologies Consortia (ALTEC) at the University of Kansas. 22 July 2010 <http://rubistar.4teachers.org/index.php?screen=CustomizeTemplate&bank_rubric_id=4§ion_id=>. Adapted by Susan Black for the Northwest History Consortium with permission.
- “American Imperialism of the Philippines: ‘A Gift from the Gods.’” Arkansas School for Mathematics, Sciences, and the Arts. 2010. Hot Springs, AR. 6 August 2010 <<http://asms.k12.ar.us/classes/humanities/worldstud/97-98/imper/Philippines/USA.HTM>>.
- Black, Susan. “Mediating Between Imperialism and Anti-Imperialism.” NWESD Organization. 2008. Anacortes, WA. 9 August 2010 <http://www.nwesd.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/7.2_Imperialism.Anti-Imperialism.Black.10-12>.
- “History Standards for Grades 5-12 United States.” UCLA National Center for History in the Schools. 2005. Los Angeles, CA. 22 July 2010 <<http://nchs.ucla.edu/standards/us-standards5-12.html>>.
- Kipling, Rudyard. “The White Man’s Burden.” 1899. The Internet Modern History Sourcebook (Fordham University). ©1997 – 2010 Paul Halsall. Bronx, NY. 6 August 2010 <<http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/mod/Kipling.html>>. Reprinted with permission.
- Monroe, President James. “Monroe Doctrine – A Speech by James Monroe.” 2 December 1823. Famous Quotes. 2010. United Kingdom. 6 August 2010 <http://www.famousquotes.me.uk/speeches/James_Monroe/index.htm>.
- OSPI. “Social Studies Essential Learning Requirements: Recommended Grade-by-Grade Sequence for Grade Level Expectations – K-12.” Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction. 2009. Olympia, WA. 22 July 2010 <<http://www.k12.wa.us/SocialStudies/pubdocs/SocialStudiesStandards.pdf>>.
- Twain, Mark. Mark Twain’s Weapons of Satire: Anti-Imperialist Writings on the Philippine-American War. Jim Zwick, editor. Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1992.